

# Toxicological Interactions in Insects Exposed to Binary Mixtures Containing a Botanical Monoterpene and a Conventional Insecticide



Mercedes MN Reynoso<sup>1</sup>, Eduardo N Zerba<sup>2</sup> and Raúl A Alzogaray<sup>1,2\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Centro de Investigaciones de Plagas e Insecticidas (UNIDEF-CITEDEF-CONICET-CIPEIN), Argentina

<sup>2</sup>Instituto de Investigación e Ingeniería Ambiental, Universidad Nacional de San Martín, Argentina

**Submission:** November 1, 2020; **Published:** November 16, 2020

**\*Corresponding author:** Raúl A. Alzogaray, Centro de Investigaciones de Plagas e Insecticidas (UNIDEF-CITEDEF-CONICET-CIPEIN), Argentina  
Email: ralzogaray@hotmail.com

## Abstract

Due to its low toxicity in mammals and very low environmental impact, some botanical monoterpenes with insecticidal activity are an attractive alternative to conventional insecticides. There is extensive literature on the insecticidal activity of individual monoterpenes, but very few studies about toxicity of simple mixtures containing monoterpenes (2-4 components) or monoterpenes and conventional insecticides (organophosphorus, carbamates, pyrethroids, neonicotinoids). Additive, antagonistic and synergistic interactions have been reported for such a mixtures when applied on several insect pest species. The identification of monoterpenes that increase the toxicity of conventional insecticides has a potential practical application. It could be the first step towards the development of products to control pests by applying lower doses of such insecticides.

**Keywords:** Botanical monoterpenes; Insecticidal mixtures; Toxicological interactions; Synergism; Conventional insecticides

## Introduction

Essential oils are combinations of secondary metabolites synthesized by aromatic plants [1]. Their low toxicity in mammals allows them to be used in aromatherapy, as well as in the production of perfumes and food additives [2]. The main components of essential oils are monoterpenes, molecules with structural skeletons made up by two isoprene units [3]. Monoterpenes have a low molecular weight, are volatile, non-polar and present a characteristic aroma [1]. Some botanical monoterpenes have insecticidal activity [4-8]. In addition to mortality, some of them produce sublethal effects in insects such as repellency, growth inhibition and feeding deterrence [9-13]. Recent findings have shown that, as observed for pyrethroid insecticides, certain botanical monoterpenes produce hyperactivity, an increase in the locomotor activity of the insects [11-13]. The insecticide properties of monoterpenes have received special attention over the last decades. This is because there is a constant search for alternative substances to control insect populations that are resistant to conventional insecticides (organophosphorus, carbamates, pyrethroids, neonicotinoids). In insects, the toxicity of monoterpenes is usually lower than that of

conventional insecticides, but their potential insecticidal activity is particularly interesting to investigate due to its aforementioned low toxicity in mammals and its very low environmental impact [14].

## Discussion

Essential oils are complex mixtures, in some cases made up by dozens of substances. Hence, their insecticide activity is almost certainly the result of numerous interactions among them (in general terms, the toxicity of a mixture can be higher -synergism- or lower -antagonism- than the sum of the individual toxicities of its components). There is extensive literature on the insecticide activity of essential oils, as well as on their individual components. Studies using simple mixtures of monoterpenes (2-4 components) or monoterpenes and conventional insecticides are much scarcer. In larvae of the tobacco cutworm, *Spodoptera litura*, binary mixtures of *trans*-anethole with citronella, thymol or  $\alpha$ -terpineol acted synergistically in terms of both acute toxicity and feeding deterrence [15]. On the other hand, binary combinations of citronella with thymol and  $\alpha$ -terpineol showed synergism for feeding deterrence, but additivity (no toxicological

interaction) for acute toxicity. Synergism also occurred when some combinations of three or four monoterpenes were applied on *Musca domestica* and the louse *Pediculus humanus capitis* [16,17].

The type of toxicological interaction can vary according to the form of application. Out of fifteen binary mixtures of monoterpenes applied in two different ways to *M. domestica*, twelve interacted synergistically and three presented additivity when applied topically [18]. However, when applied in vapor phase, eight were synergistic, six were additive and one antagonistic. Synergism seems to prevail in binary mixtures of monoterpenes. The assessment of 435 mixtures in the cotton leafworm *S. littoralis*, elicited 211 synergistic and 97 antagonistic interactions [19]. Synergic effects were also observed in mixtures of  $\gamma$ -terpinene or terpinen-4-ol with the organophosphorus profenofos and the carbamate methomyl in *S. littoralis* and the bean aphid *Aphis fabae* [20]. In the blood-sucking bug, *Triatoma infestans*, menthol and menthyl acetate synergized the toxicity of the organophosphorus azamethiphos both when applied topically and by exposure to films on filter paper [21]. Eugenol also synergized azamethiphos when the mixture was applied on filter paper; however, no interaction occurred when topical application was performed. Monoterpenes usually increase the toxicity of conventional insecticides in less than one order in magnitude, but a striking exception occurred in *T. infestans*. In first instar nymphs of this species, the toxicity of azamethiphos increased dramatically when applied topically together with menthyl acetate (15 000x) or menthol (49 000x) [21].

Toxicological interactions may occur in any of the toxicokinetic and toxicodynamic processes of the substances involved: absorption, distribution, metabolism and target binding [22,23]. The limited information on the toxicokinetics and toxicodynamics of monoterpenes in insects only allows for very generalized speculations on the possible mechanisms underlying their toxicological interactions. The mechanism of a toxicological interaction between two monoterpenes was carried out in larvae of the cabbage looper, *Trichoplusia ni*, where thymol synergized the toxicity of *p*-cymene by increasing its cuticular penetration [24,25]. There is also a report on a case of behavioral synergism, where a change in the behavior of *T. infestans* produced by a sublethal dose of a monoterpene increased the exposure of the insects to a pyrethroid applied on a filter paper [26]. Toxicological, behavioral, pharmacological and analytical chemistry experiments demonstrated that nymphs of *T. infestans* hyperactivated by eugenol picked up more insecticide, and subsequently become intoxicated faster, than non-hyperactivated nymphs when exposed to a permethrin-treated surface. Some evidence suggest that the octopaminergic system participates in the hyperactivant effect of eugenol in *T. infestans* [27].

## Conclusion

The toxicological interactions that involves botanical monoterpenes and conventional insecticides is a field that is only

just being explored, but that already sheds promising results for pest control. The examples described in the previous paragraphs suggest that aromatic plants are a rich source of insecticide synergists. The identification of monoterpenes that increase the toxicity of conventional insecticides has a potential practical application. It could be the first step towards the development of products to control pests by applying lower doses of such insecticides. The mixtures that are more efficient synergically, such as menthol and menthyl acetate with azamethiphos in *T. infestans*, should be assessed in different insect pests to confirm whether it is an isolated phenomenon or not. On the other hand, studying the mechanisms underlying these interactions will lead the way towards finding appropriate monoterpenes to be included in new mixtures.

## Acknowledgement

ENZ is a former member, and RAA is a member of the Carrera del Investigador Científico y Tecnológico del Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas of Argentina (CONICET). MMNR is a fellowship holder of the CONICET. The authors thanks to Merissa Dennis for her invitation to write this mini review, and to Catriona Kirkwood for correcting the English language. Authors research mentioned in this mini review was supported by several subsidies from the Agencia Nacional de Promoción Científica y Tecnológica of Argentina (ANPCyT), CONICET, and Chemotecnica SA.

## References

1. Cutler G, Cutler J (1999) Biologically active natural products: Agrochemicals. Boca Raton, USA.
2. Bakkali F, Averbeck S, Averbeck D, Adomar M (2008) Biological effects of essential oils - A review. Food Chem Toxicol 46(2): 446-475.
3. Isman MB, Machial CM (2006) Pesticides based on plant essential oils: From traditional practice to commercialization. In: Rai M, Carpinella MC (Eds), Naturally occurring bioactive compounds. Elsevier, Amsterdam, The Netherlands: pp. 29-44.
4. Isman MB (2006) Botanical insecticides, deterrents, and repellents in modern agriculture and an increasingly regulated world. Annu Rev Entomol 51: 45-66.
5. Sfara V, Zerba EN, Alzogaray RA (2009) Fumigant insecticidal activity and repellent effect of five essential oils and seven monoterpenes on first-instar nymphs of *Rhodnius prolixus*. J Med Entomol 46(3): 511-515.
6. Tarelli G, Zerba EN, Alzogaray R (2009) Toxicity to vapor exposure and topical application of essential oils and monoterpenes on *Musca domestica* (Diptera: Muscidae). J Econ Entomol 102(3): 1383-1388.
7. Alzogaray RA, Lucia A, Zerba EN, Masuh HM (2011) Insecticidal activity of essential oils from eleven eucalyptus spp. and two hybrids: Lethal and sublethal effects of their major components on *Blattella germanica*. J Econ Entomol 104(2): 595-600.
8. Regnault Roger C, Vincent C, Arnason JT (2012) Essential oils in insect control: Low-risk products in a high-stakes world. Annu Rev Entomol 57: 405-424.
9. Isman MB (2001) Biopesticides based on phytochemical. In: Koul O, Dhaliwal GS (Eds), Phytochemical biopesticides. Hardwood Academic Publishers, Amsterdam, The Netherlands:pp. 1-12.

10. Dambolena JS, Zunino MP, Herrera JM, Pizzolitto RP, Areco VA, et al. (2016) Terpenes: Natural products for controlling insects of importance to human health -A structure-activity relationship study. *Psyche* (2): 1-17.
11. Moretti A, Zerba EN, Alzogaray RA (2013) Behavioral and toxicological responses of *Rhodnius prolixus* and *Triatoma infestans* (Hemiptera: Reduviidae) to ten monoterpenic alcohols. *J Med Entomol* 50(5): 1046-1054.
12. Moretti NA, Zerba EN, Alzogaray RA (2015) Lethal and sublethal effects of eucalyptol on *Triatoma infestans* and *Rhodnius prolixus*, vectors of Chagas disease. *Entomol Exp Appl* 154(1): 62-70.
13. Moretti AN, Seccacini EA, Zerba EN, Canale D, Alzogaray RA (2017) The botanical monoterpenes linalool and eugenol flush-out nymphs of *Triatoma infestans*. *J Med Entomol* 54(5): 1293-1298.
14. Isman MB (2000) Plant essential oils for pest and disease management. *Crop Prot* 19(10): 603-608.
15. Hummelbrunner LA, Isman MB (2001) Acute, sublethal, antifeedant, and synergistic effects of monoterpenoid essential oil compounds on the tobacco cutworm, *Spodoptera litura* (Lep., Noctuidae). *J Agric Food Chem* 49(2): 715-720.
16. Gallardo A, Picollo MI, González Audino P, Mougabure Cueto G (2012) Insecticidal activity of individual and mixed monoterpenoids of geranium essential oil against *Pediculus humanus capitis* (Phthiraptera: Pediculidae). *J Med Entomol* 49(2): 332-335.
17. Gallardo A, Picollo MI, Mougabure Cueto G (2015) Lethal activity of individual and mixed monoterpenoids of geranium essential oil on *Musca domestica*. *Parasitol Res* 114(3): 1229-1232.
18. Pavela R (2008) Insecticidal properties of several essential oils on the house fly (*Musca domestica* L.). *Phytother Res* 22(2): 274-278.
19. Pavela R (2014) Acute, synergistic and antagonistic effects of some aromatic compounds on the *Spodoptera littoralis* Bois. (Lep., Noctuidae) larvae. *Ind Crop Prod* 60: 247-258.
20. Abbassy MA, Abdelgaleil SAM, Rabie RYA (2009) Insecticidal and synergistic effects of *Majorana hortensis* essential oil and some of its major constituents. *Entomol Exp Appl*: 131(3): 225-232.
21. Reynoso MMN, Seccacini EA, Zerba EN, Alzogaray RA (2020) Botanical monoterpenes synergise the toxicity of azamethiphos in the vector of Chagas disease, *Triatoma infestans* (Hemiptera: Reduviidae). *Trop Med Int Health* 25(12): 1480-1485.
22. Wilkinson CF (1976) Insecticide Interaction. In: Wilkinson CF (Ed), *Insecticide biochemistry and physiology*. Plenum Press, New York, USA: pp. 605-647.
23. Nelson BK (1999) Interactions between occupational and environmental factors in toxicology, hazard evaluation and risk assessment. In: Ballantyne B, Marrs T, Syversen T (Eds), *General and applied toxicology*. Macmillan Press, London: pp. 1415-1424.
24. Tak JH, Jovel E, Isman MB (2016) Comparative and synergistic activity of *Rosmarinus officinalis* L. essential oil constituents against the larvae and an ovarian cell line of the cabbage looper, *Trichoplusia ni* (Lepidoptera: Noctuidae). *Pest Manag Sci* 72(3): 474-480.
25. Tak JK, Isman MB (2017) Enhanced cuticular penetration as the mechanism of synergy for the major constituents of thyme essential oil in the cabbage looper, *Trichoplusia ni*. *Ind Crop Prod* 101: 29-35.
26. Reynoso MMN, Lucia A, Zerba EN, Alzogaray RA (2018) Eugenol-hyperactivated nymphs of *Triatoma infestans* become intoxicated faster than non-hyperactivated nymphs when exposed to a permethrin-treated surface. *Parasites & Vectors* 11: 573.
27. Reynoso MMN, Lucia A, Zerba EN, Alzogaray RA (2020) The octopamine receptor is a possible target for eugenol-induced hyperactivity in the blood-sucking bug *Triatoma infestans* (Hemiptera: Reduviidae). *J Med Entomol* 57(2): 627-630.



This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License  
DOI: [10.19080/OAJT.2020.04.555644](https://doi.org/10.19080/OAJT.2020.04.555644)

**Your next submission with Juniper Publishers  
will reach you the below assets**

- Quality Editorial service
- Swift Peer Review
- Reprints availability
- E-prints Service
- Manuscript Podcast for convenient understanding
- Global attainment for your research
- Manuscript accessibility in different formats  
( Pdf, E-pub, Full Text, Audio)
- Unceasing customer service

Track the below URL for one-step submission  
<https://juniperpublishers.com/online-submission.php>