

Dissemination of Antibiotic Resistance Genes during Sludge Anaerobic Digestion: The Roles of Temperature, Sludge Pretreatment and Nanoparticles



Jianhong Shi and Bing Xie*

School of Ecological and Environmental Science, East China Normal University, China

Submission: October 13, 2017; Published: December 20, 2017

*Corresponding author: Bing Xie, Shanghai Key Lab for Urban Ecological Processes and Eco-Restoration, School of Ecological and Environmental Science, East China Normal University, 500 Dong Chuan Road, Shanghai 200241, People's Republic of China, China, Email: Bxie@des.ecnu.edu.cn

Abstract

Activated sludge is an important source of Antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs), which will pose a potential risk to human and livestock health if treating inappropriately. Anaerobic digestion is an efficient way for reducing ARGs quantities, and there is a need to study the effect of factors on dissemination of ARGs during sludge anaerobic digestion for the effectiveness on the ARGs control. This review summarizes current literature on the influence of temperature, sludge pretreatment and nanoparticles (NPs) on the fate of ARGs during anaerobic digestion. Studies have shown that thermophilic sludge and sludge pretreatment can lessen the risk of ARGs diffusion to some extent. Effect of NPs as emerging materials on ARGs is a potential research prospect and further research is needed to control the possible risks of NPs on the dissemination of ARGs during anaerobic digestion.

Keywords: Antibiotic resistance genes; Anaerobic digestion; Temperature; Sludge pretreatment; Nanoparticles

Introduction

Antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) have been regarded as emerging contaminants in recent years [1,2], and they were extensively detected in activated sludge [3]. The potential land use of activated sludge may result in the dissemination of ARGs [4]. Anaerobic digestion is an efficient way for reducing ARG quantities, thereby lessening the land-applied risks of activated sludge [5]. Temperature and sludge pretreatment are the significant influencing factors for the reduction of ARGs [6,7], and nanoparticles, as an emerging contaminant, is a potentially valuable factor for ARGs control during anaerobic digestion [8]. This mini review highlights current literatures on the influence of temperature, sludge pretreatment and nanoparticles on the fate of ARGs during anaerobic digestion to assess the potential of the three factors for the attenuation or increase of ARGs, and benefits to understand the risk of releasing ARGs into the environment.

Effect of Temperature on ARGs during Sludge Anaerobic Digestion

Temperature was demonstrated as a crucial variable for specific ARGs removal. With the increasing anaerobic digestion temperatures from 22 to 55 °C, tetracycline resistant

genes (*tet*) and class I integron gene (*intI1*) were increasingly removed [9]. Ma et al. [10] have also found that erythromycin resistant genes (*erm(B)*, *erm(F)*) and *tet(O)*, *tet(W)* were more effectively reduced in thermophilic anaerobic digesters compared to mesophilic anaerobic digestion. In two-phase anaerobic digestion, the quantity of ARGs was reduced in the acidogenic phase of thermophilic digestion, whereas a rebound in their quantity was caused in subsequent methanogenic phase. High temperature can efficiently destroy bacterial cells with ARGs to reduce vertical transferability of ARGs [11]. Moreover, thermophilic sludge had a smaller mobilome, such as plasmids, insertion sequences and integrons, suggesting that high temperature could lower the horizontal transfer potential of ARGs [6]. However, Zhang et al. [6] has found that the abundance of total ARGs or their diversity in either the thermophilic or mesophilic treatment showed no measureable change using metagenomic approach [12].

Effect of Sludge Pretreatment on Args during Sludge Anaerobic Digestion

Sludge pretreatment was obviously necessary to improve the low efficiency of sludge hydrolysis during anaerobic digestion

process. It was widely demonstrated that sludge pretreatment is able to improve subsequent sludge anaerobic digestion efficiency [13-15]. Additionally, different pretreatments in sludge anaerobic digestion have been reported to affect the reduction of ARGs. Thermal hydrolysis (TH) pretreatment significantly reduces all ARGs compared with that receiving untreated sludge during anaerobic digestion [10]. Sludge anaerobic digestion with microwave and microwave-H₂O₂-alkaline pretreatments showed slightly better ARGs attenuation efficiency [7]). TH pretreatment in three sludge pretreatments, including microwave, TH and ozone pretreatment, resulted in greater ARGs reduction [16]. Additionally, microwave- H₂O₂ could also reduce the absolute quantity of all ARGs and promote the relative abundance of most ARGs at the pretreatment process [17]. After subsequent anaerobic digestion, both total ARGs quantities and relative abundance were enriched, and only two-stage AD showed some advantages over ARGs abundance reduction.

Effect of NPs on ARGs during Sludge Anaerobic Digestion

Widely using of the nanotechnology resulted in more and more nanoparticles have inevitably entered into sludge, which affect sludge anaerobic digestion processes. The presence of nanoscale zero-valent iron (nZVI) during anaerobic digestion contributed to the abatement of odor and the improvement of biogas production [18]. nZVI could also disrupt cell membranes and has negative effect on methanogenesis in anaerobic digestion [19]. Different nanoparticles probably impacted distinctly to sludge anaerobic digestion [20,21].

The effect of nanoparticles on ARGs occurrence is a meaningful research prospect during sludge anaerobic digestion. Several studies have found that in thermophilic anaerobic digester process, Ag NPs had no significant effect on ARGs occurrence [22]. They are converted to Ag₂S NPs during anaerobic digestion process, which sequester Ag and prevent biological interactions with the digester microbial community [8,23,24]. To date, other nanoparticles and their influence mechanism on ARGs during the digestion process have seldom investigated. However, in other environmental systems, Al₂O₃ NPs and TiO₂ NPs have been reported to injure cell membrane and stimulate the transcription activity of RP4 transfer gene, thus they facilitate conjugation mediated by RP4 [25,26]. Graphene oxide (GO) have also been demonstrated to promote the conjugative transfer of plasmid from 1 to over 3 folds in the water environment [27]. Consequently, in future studies, a large number of studies should be carried out to investigate the effects of nanoparticles on dissemination of ARGs during sludge anaerobic digestion.

Conclusions and Future Outlook

To date, thermophilic sludge and sludge pretreatment have been demonstrated as an efficient way for specific ARGs

removal. However, some ARGs are not completely removed, and higher temperature or more advanced pretreatment method may be needed to denature DNA and completely degrade ARGs. Additionally, as NPs are widely available in sludge, they impact significantly the sludge anaerobic digester process. However, the effect of various NPs on dissemination of ARGs is rare reported. Moreover, the interaction mechanism between NPs and ARGs are urgently needed to be investigated so as to control the potential risk of ARGs enrichment and transfer. In our ideal expectation, the properties of nanoparticles as much as possible can be used to promote anaerobic digestion process and to reduce dissemination of ARGs.

Acknowledgment

This work was supported by the Natural Science Foundation of China (21577038,31370510).

References

1. Pruden A, Pei RT, Storteboom H, Carlson KH (2006) Antibiotic resistance genes as emerging contaminants: studies in northern Colorado. *Environ Sci Technol* 40(23): 7445-7450.
2. Wu D, Huang Z, Yang K, Graham D, Xie B (2015) Relationships between antibiotics and antibiotic resistance gene levels in municipal solid waste leachates in Shanghai, China. *Environ Sci Technol* 49(7): 4122-4128.
3. Calero-Caceres W, Melgarejo A, Colomer-Lluch M, Stoll C, Lucena F, et al. (2014) Sludge as a potential important source of antibiotic resistance genes in both the bacterial and bacteriophage fractions. *Environ Sci Technol* 48(13): 7602-7611.
4. Chen Q, An X, Li H, Su J, Man Y, et al. (2016) Long-term field application of sewage sludge increases the abundance of antibiotic resistance genes in soil. *Environ Int* 92-93: 1-10.
5. Huang H, Chen Y, Zheng X, Su Y, Wan R, et al. (2016) Distribution of tetracycline resistance genes in anaerobic treatment of waste sludge: the role of pH in regulating tetracycline resistant bacteria and horizontal gene transfer. *Bioresour Technol* 218: 1284-1289.
6. Tian Z, Zhang Y, Yu B, Yang M (2016) Changes of resistome, mobilome and potential hosts of antibiotic resistance genes during the transformation of anaerobic digestion from mesophilic to thermophilic. *Water Res* 98: 261-269.
7. Tong J, Liu J, Zheng X, Zhang J, Ni X (2016) Fate of antibiotic resistance bacteria and genes during enhanced anaerobic digestion of sewage sludge by microwave pretreatment. *Bioresour Technol* 217: 37-43.
8. Kim B, Miller J, Monsegue N, Levard C, Hong Y, et al. (2016) Silver sulfidation in thermophilic anaerobic digesters and effects on antibiotic resistance genes. *Environ Engineer Sci* 33(1): 1-10.
9. Diehl DL, LaPara TM (2010) Effect of temperature on the fate of genes encoding tetracycline resistance and the integrase of class 1 integrons within anaerobic and aerobic digesters treating municipal wastewater solids. *Environ Sci Technol* 44 (23): 9128-9133.
10. Ma Y, Wilson CA, Novak JT, Riffat R, Aynur S, et al. (2011) Effect of various sludge digestion conditions on sulfonamide, macrolide, and tetracycline resistance genes and class I integrons. *Environ Sci Technol* 45(18): 7855-7861.
11. Wu Y, Cui E, Zuo Y, Cheng W, Rensing C, et al. (2016) Influence of two-phase anaerobic digestion on fate of selected antibiotic resistance genes and class I integrons in municipal wastewater sludge. *Bioresour Technol* 211: 414-421.

12. Zhang T, Yang Y, Pruden A (2015) Effect of temperature on removal of antibiotic resistance genes by anaerobic digestion of activated sludge revealed by metagenomic approach. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 99(18): 7771-7779.
13. Liu J, Tong J, Wei Y, Wang Y (2015) Microwave and its combined processes: an effective way for enhancing anaerobic digestion and dewaterability of sewage sludge? *J Water Reuse Desalin* 5(3): 264-270.
14. Wang Y, Wei Y, Liu J (2009) Effect of H₂O₂ dosing strategy on sludge pretreatment by microwave- H₂O₂ advanced oxidation process. *J Hazard Mater* 169(1-3): 680-684.
15. Kuglarz M, Karakashev D, Angelidaki I (2013) Microwave and thermal pretreatment as methods for increasing the biogas potential of secondary sludge from municipal wastewater treatment plants. *Bioresour Technol* 134: 290-297.
16. Tong J, Lu X, Zhang J, Sui Q, Wang R, et al. (2017) Occurrence of antibiotic resistance genes and mobile genetic elements in enterococci and genomic DNA during anaerobic digestion of pharmaceutical waste sludge with different pretreatments. *Bioresour Technol* 235: 316-324.
17. Zhang J, Liu J, Wang Y, Yu D, Sui Q (2017) Profiles and drivers of antibiotic resistance genes distribution in one-stage and two-stage sludge anaerobic digestion based on microwave- H₂O₂ pretreatment. *Bioresour Technol* 241: 573-581.
18. Su L, Shi X, Guo G, Zhao A, Zhao Y (2013) Stabilization of sewage sludge in the presence of nanoscale zero-valent iron (nZVI): abatement of odor and improvement of biogas production. *J Mater Cycles Waste Manag* 15 (4): 461-468.
19. Yang Y, Guo J, Hu Z (2013) Impact of nano zero valent iron (NZVI) on methanogenic activity and population dynamics in anaerobic digestion. *Water Res* 47(17): 6790-6800.
20. Estrella J, Alvarez R, Field J (2013) Toxicity assessment of inorganic nanoparticles to acetoclastic and hydrogenotrophic methanogenic activity in anaerobic granular sludge. *J Hazard Mater* 260: 278-285.
21. Mu H, Chen Y (2011) Long-term effect of ZnO nanoparticles on waste activated sludge anaerobic digestion. *Water Res* 45 (17): 5612-5620.
22. Miller JH, Novak JT, Knocke WR, Young K, Hong Y, et al. (2013) Effect of silver nanoparticles and antibiotics on antibiotic resistance genes in anaerobic digestion. *Water Environ Res* 85: 411-421.
23. Kim B, Park C, Murayama M, Hochella MF (2010) Discovery and characterization of silver sulfide nanoparticles in final sewage sludge products. *Environ Sci Technol* 44 (19): 7509-7514.
24. Impellitteri C, Harmon S, Silva R, Miller B, Scheckel G, et al. (2013) Transformation of silver nanoparticles in fresh, aged, and incinerated biosolids. *Water Res* 47(12): 3878-3886.
25. Qian D, Yang D, Zhang B, Chen Z, Jin M, et al. (2013) Effect of nano-TiO₂ on the conjugative transfer of the PR4 plasmid. *Mil Med Sci* 37 (3): 895-904.
26. Qiu Z, Yu Y, Chen Z, Jin M, Yang D (2012) Nanoalumina promotes the horizontal transfer of multi resistance genes mediated by plasmids across genera. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 109(13): 4944-4949.
27. Guo M, Zhang G (2017) Graphene oxide in the water environment could affect tetracycline-antibiotic resistance. *Chemosphere* 183: 197-203.



This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License
DOI: [10.19080/AIBM.2017.07.555720](https://doi.org/10.19080/AIBM.2017.07.555720)

Your next submission with Juniper Publishers will reach you the below assets

- Quality Editorial service
- Swift Peer Review
- Reprints availability
- E-prints Service
- Manuscript Podcast for convenient understanding
- Global attainment for your research
- Manuscript accessibility in different formats
(Pdf, E-pub, Full Text, Audio)
- Unceasing customer service

Track the below URL for one-step submission

<https://juniperpublishers.com/online-submission.php>